

# LOCAL DISPUTE HIGHLIGHTS NATIONAL PROBLEM

Complicated issues about personal liberty, public and private property, and the right to film have been raised by a local confrontation.

On 14 October, security staff took issue with Stefan Karpa (pictured), a private photographer who had – without seeking permission – filmed gnomes (through a glass pane) displayed in Firetrap on Multrees Walk. Staff followed him to York Place, requesting in strong terms that he delete images taken on private property. Mr Karpa refused to delete anything, insisting he had been entitled to film and had done nothing unlawful. Any effort to touch or constrain him would constitute assault, he argued. Recordings of the dispute appeared later on YouTube [http://www.edinburghseasons.com/2010-10-14/mind-where-you-snap-in-edinburgh/]. They make for compelling viewing, and resulted in a protest flashmob four days later (*Breaking news* 18.10.10).

*Spurtle* understands Multrees Walk is indeed private property but debate surrounds whether this permits restrictions on filming. Some, like land-issues campaigner Andy Wightman, say that under Scottish law – the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982, Section 133 – a public place constitutes anywhere (whether or not a thoroughfare) to which the public enjoys unrestricted access. According to this argument, then, whilst privately owned, Multrees Walk remains public and restrictions should not apply.



Multrees Walk management issued an apology on 21 October, saying that only commercial photographers need seek prior permission in future. However, its statement rather muddied the waters by then going on to conflate concerns expressed earlier about crime (particularly ram-raiding) with concerns about terrorism (see *Extras* 1.11.10). *Spurtle* cannot claim to understand all the legal minutiae, but we do share widespread misgivings about creeping privatisation of civic spaces and any imposition of arbitrary rules on what, under other circumstances, is normal and lawful behaviour.

## BRIGHT SPARK WINS WITH ILLUSIONIST REVIEW



Congratulations to Harmony Rose Bremner – 11-year-old daughter of *Trainspotting* actor and erstwhile Broughton habitué Ewen Bremner – who has won Film Education's Young Film Critic of the Year Award for her review of *The Illusionist* (Issue 184). Harmony was encouraged to take part by staff at St Mary's R.C. Primary School on East London Street, and received her award (in the age 7–11 category) at a ceremony in London on 19 October. Her father flew in from Hollywood for the occasion, which was also attended by her Stockbridge mother, two friends and three teachers. The judges commented: 'Taking on quite a tough/nonobvious movie to review, Harmony does an excellent job pointing out aspects of the plot and the story's more emotional ambitions'. Read her entry in *Extras* (1.11.10).

### CONSTRUCTIVE CRITICISM FOR WORLD HERITAGE SITE DRAFT PLAN

New Town and Broughton Community Council (NTBCC) has reacted with disappointment to the 'Draft Management Plan for the Edinburgh World Heritage Site, 2010–15' (*Breaking news* 19.8.10). Planning Convenor John Knight described it as

Planning Convenor John Knight described it as a 'largely turgid regurgitation' of the previous plan which, although it had many 'objectives', contained not a single 'target'. Amid 'much waffle', Princes Street was not even mentioned.

Speaking on 4 October, Mr Knight recommended additions including commitments to: maintain architectural details; continue the conservation programme without dropping standards of materials and workmanship; increase awareness and understanding through, for example, interpretation boards; acknowledge the EWHS's economic contribution. He also called for a buffer zone controlling development close to the Site, effective underground storage of waste, and clear criteria by which progress could be judged.

Halting the decline of Princes Street was a critical problem, he argued, whose solution is important for the whole city. There should be no pavement cafés there and no more demolition of listed buildings.

OtherNTBCC members spoke of a moral responsibility to take care of the EWHS, not just to manage the aspirations of its users (particularly business users).

# **Briefly**

Thanks in part to Spurtle's increasingly patriotic and politically correct broadsides (Breaking news 21.10.10), Nelson's signal returned to the Royal Navy and Royal Marine Club in Broughton Rd on Trafalgar Day after 2 years' absence. Members there are keen to recruit the services of an ex-RN signalman so that next year's centenary celebrations pass off flawlessly.

Police have appealed for witnesses after a 25-year-old man was struck by a Vauxhall Vectra at the junction of Broughton St and Picardy Place at 3:20am on 22 Oct. He was taken to hospital with serious head and neck injuries. Tel. 311 3131 or Crimestoppers (in confidence and anonymously) Tel. 0800 555 111.

Broughton History Society meets next at 7pm on Mon. 8 Nov. in Drummond CHS. Dr David Gavine will bang on about local steam-hammer inventor 'James Nasmyth, Engineer and Astronomer' (see Issue 183).

Leith Central Community Council is looking for more 'Broughton voices'. reports Councillor Louise Lang. LCCC's geographical spread extends across Redbraes as far as St Mark's Park and the railway line running parallel to McDonald Rd. It also includes the east side of Leith Walk as far south as London Rd. So there is an obvious area of shared interest which is currently under-represented. If you would like to find out more, visit http://leithcentralcc. wikidot com

Locals near Bellevue House (Issue 186) have welcomed new occupants' (more or less green-fingered plumbers) replanting of adjacent land.

Elizabeth Fraser (née Simpson) has contacted Spurtle from Sydney, Australia. She was born at 7 New Broughton in 1931, then 'slum buildings', and now seeks a photograph of her birthplace then. See Letters.

As forecast (Issue 187), Broughtonians have been less than impressed by recent CEC efforts to gauge opinion on budget decisions. It was typically described as 'a bit of fairly meaningless consultation as it was an evening of voting on disingenuous questions about what kind of cuts one would support'. However, some were considerably more supportive. See Breaking news 1.11.10.

Doubts have also been raised over Neighbourhood Partnerships' efforts to be more open and responsive. Better advertised quarterly public meetings may use 'interactive' electronic voting pads, but some NTBCC members suggest button pushing can be a tool to curtail awkward discussion. Others fear special-interest groups may manipulate such events. Cllr Dundas agrees that such meetings are open to abuse, but asserts that this has not yet been a problem 'thanks to the good sense of the hive mind of the Edinburgh people'.

CEC has allocated £20,000 for improvements to Gayfield Square garden. Better paths and benches will be provided.

# New shadow junior minister does porridge

Mark Lazarowicz, Westminster MP for Edinburgh North and Leith, was appointed Shadow Junior Minister for International Development on 10 October. He will serve as frontbench deputy to Shadow Secretary Harriet Harman.

International development has always been one of my interests so I am delighted to have this opportunity to speak on this issue in Parliament,' Mr Lazarowicz told Spurtle. 'One of my main priorities will be ... to put pressure on the UK government to make sure the world

community meets the commitments it has made at various international summits. 'I will still be able to campaign on issues affecting the local community, for example I have been taking a leading role in the campaign to establish the HQ of the proposed "Green Investment Bank" in Edinburgh.

'I intend to continue to be as accessible as I am now to local constituents. I will still be holding my 3 surgeries each week in the constituency. And of course, there are many local groups which themselves have a particular interest in international development issues.

Shortly after his appointment, Mr Lazarowicz attended an event to mark World Porridge and World Food Days, at which MPs tasted mugs of cheap, filling and nutritious corn-soya porridge. It was organised by Mary's Meals, a charity running school feeding projects in developing countries, and the All Party Parliamentary Group on Agriculture and Food for Development. How much Mr Lazarowicz enjoyed his mug of 'likuni phala' is not recorded, but his face and right hand suggest it could have done with more spurtling.

#### Council consults on New | Somerville goes against Town bins

Long-awaited Council consultation on containerisation in the New Town is under way (Issues 184–5).

Evening meetings between officials, councillors and residents associations will consider possible locations, numbers and sizes for containers, and ways of managing the visual impact.

At least six events will focus on: Royal Terrace, Fettes Row and Cumberland Street (4 November); Great King Street; the Central and Eastern New Town; Calton, Regent and Royal Terraces (15 November); Forth and Union Streets; and the Moray Feus in the West End.

MikePenny, CityCentreNeighbourhood Manager, aims to have a strategy finalised by early in the New Year. Greater recycling of food waste, and trials of gullproof bags during the breeding season are guaranteed.

Edinburgh World Heritage will host a meeting at 12:30pm on 25 November in 5 Charlotte Square to discuss a shortterm solution to gulls, and a long-term plan for waste management. Director Adam Wilkinson notes: 'If we don't pull together a series of ideas, the likelihood is that we will be presented with one idea by colleagues at the Council'. NTBCC may hold a public meeting once the exact nature of proposals is known.

opponents Proponents and of containerisation are equally welcome at public meetings. But since some residents associations normally meet in private homes, Spurtle recommends those wanting to attend should contact Mike Penny early so that big enough venues can be arranged.

# the grain



Lothians MSP Shirley-Anne Somerville has campaigned on many issues during her political career, but few of them as close to her heart as coeliac disease: a little-known but surprisingly common complaint for which there is an absolute solution. She told Spurtle why.

'Failure to thrive' is a horrible term which makes you feel like you've failed as a parent. But that was the wording used for our 1-year-old daughter as she lost weight.

She sat about with no energy as other kids her age blossomed. After months of misdiagnosis one doctor spotted the signs of coeliac disease – a gluten intolerance. Once moved to a gluten-free diet she never looked back.

Shopping now takes a lot longer as every label has to be checked, but we are getting there. Eating out is problematic as many places don't know what is in their food.

One in a hundred people is coeliac, but many are misdiagnosed. That's why I'm working to raise awareness of the disease so that others can thrive just like my daughter.

Read Ms Somerville's full article in Breaking news (1.11.10).



# Nooks & crannies Mixed fortunes



Here it is, another dream for the winds. How could a sunflower seed blown by but germinate and blaze into flower in October? It emerged from a garden wall behind Drummond Place and ers emerged into the light on 13-14 [£181,250. The tenebrous offerings by Messrs October. *Spurtle* salutes it and them.

## Broughton Street Lane: Part 2

Coincidentally, apropos 'The ghost horses of Broughton' piece in Issue 187, this painting by Henry Kondracki was one of several highlights in his striking show of oil paintings at the Scottish Gallery, Dundas Street from 6–30 October.

Here, too, there is perhaps an element of film noir, although the rain is not quite horizontal and the umbrellas seem positively sunlit à la Cherbourg. But the streaming cobbles, leading to the mysterious door between Siam Thani and Something Fishy, and the suspiciously bright window above, might perhaps stir the little grey cells of Philip Marlowe or our own Inspector Rebus.

This is a scintillating example of Mr Kondracki's work, which explores and celebrates Edinburgh from less predictable nooks, crannies and perspectives. *JRM* 

#### A lost church and a church that never was



1862. The winning entry in a competition, it was constructed for £13,000 on the site of a quarry, its 180ft tower prompting much local pride.

Ownership transferred to the United Free Church in 1900, and in 1929 to the Church of Scotland, at which point it was renamed the Barony Church to avoid confusion. Amalgamation with another congregation in 1933 led to a fourth name change - Barony and St James' Church - but the now crumbling structure (the tower was partially dismantled) was occupied for many years by Mutries the theatrical costumier. All but the adjacent, neo-Gothic manse was demolished, and in 1983 replaced by the present office block (http://canmore.rcahms.gov.uk).

Runner-up to Rochead's design of 1858 was one by Alexander 'Greek' Thomson (1817–75). His proposed plan and elevation are now held by the Glasgow School of Art (for a time wrongly catalogued under St George's Church, Edinburgh). The design is substantially that of the St Vincent Street Church in Glasgow (pictured, but imagine you are viewing the Albany/Broughton St junction from Forth St), built in 1859. This internationally recognised masterpiece - 'awe-inspiring in its sublime, recondite, exotic strangeness ...' (Gavin Stamp at www.bdonline.co.uk) - could so easily have been Broughton's. See Breaking news (1.11.10). AM

## for Scottish art

The Sotheby's Scottish Sale of paintings previewed at Mansfield the Centre Traquair and sold in London on 29 September achieved mixed results. Once again,



Broughton's own Anne Redpath, RSA, ARA was the star turn. Her exuberant oil on board of scarlet poppies and blue lupins in a white jug, seemingly suspended yet firmly grounded in a space of white and blue (above; estimate the wind or dropped by a bird upon the £80K–120K) was sold to a lucky bidder for slightest of crannies not only survive £103,250. S.J. Peploe's 'Still Life of Roses in a Blue and White Vase' (estimate £250K–350K) yielded £265,250, and his fellow Colourist John Duncan Ferguson's joyful 'A Montmartre continued to shine as the Chilean min- Nightclub' (estimate £150K-£250K) fetched

Vettriano and Howson were not sold.

# **Briefly**

Exhibitions: (1) Synaesthesia II will run at the Union Gallery on Broughton St from 4-29 Nov. It comprises new work by abstract painter Trevor Jones. Viewers can listen to the Scottish bands and singers who inspired the artist using a personal MP3 player. See Breaking news (5.11.10). (2) New collections by Fiona Wilson and Paul Muzni will show at the Axolotl Gallery, Dundas St from 5-25 Nov. Wilson promises tempting visions of burlesque fallen angels. Muzni's female nudes may start with the human figure but usually end in **painterly abstractions** about e.g. the weight of a brushstroke or the relationship of one area to another.

CEC's Planning Subcommittee is 'minded to approve' planning permission for Foremost Properties (Scotland) LLP's major residential development at 132 McDonald Road (Ref. 10/01513/FUL; Issue 185). Neighbours are still pressing for concessions (Breaking news, 19.11.10).

St Andrew's and St George's West Church of Scotland, George St, holds its annual Coffee Morning & Sale at the Undercroft on Sat. 27 Nov., 10am-noon. Jewellery, small gifts, pictures, Christmas cards and Scottish books (including many signed 1st edns) will be on sale.

Many will remember the above church's Christian Aid Book Sale in May. Since then, organisers have raised a further £9,873. of which £2,000 went immediately to flood relief in Pakistan.

Royal Mail's former sorting office on Brunswick St has been bought for £4m by London-based Attila Asset Management. They plan a mixed commercial and residential development. Spurtle recalls Attila the Hun's reputation for mixed commercial and residential development, and wonders. See Breaking news (26.10.10).

The future of Bellevue Crescent's Art Amatoria is secure for the foreseeable future following a successful appeal to the Scottish Government against CEC's refusal to grant retrospective planning permission (Ref. 09/02866/FUL; Issue 179). Caroline Hay, who runs the gallery, says the decision came as a big relief.

City of Edinburgh Council will review Traffic Regulation Orders concerning the troubled tram project on 23 Nov.

Calling lapsed subscribers! The 2010-11 cycle has started and you're not on it. Please send £12 cheques made out to Spurtle to the address on p.4 saying where you wish copies to be delivered.

The Broughton St Traders Association seeks a deputy coordinator to help with light email and paperwork duties. Contact Lucy Tanat-Jones at Organic Pleasures for further details: lulu@organicpleasures.co.uk

All are invited to attend Drummond CHS's Winter Warmer Concert which will take place on Wednesday 1 Dec., 6:15-7:30pm. Small musical items will be on show and the 'Fairtrade Café' will be on hand for purchase of teas/coffees and sweet delights. Tickets (first come first served) on sale at the school from Wed. 17 Nov., £3 (adults), £2.00 (concs).



Society's

History

One of these was St Mary's Free



Eagle-eyed readers have spotted two charming art-graffiti by **REMOTE** in Rodney Place. The one shown above nicely parallels a drainpipe and **Audrey Hepburn**'s gloved arm. The other, of a birdhouse and new residents, can be seen in *Breaking news* (1.11.10).

After a very long and rather **difficult labour**, the New Town & Broughton Community Council has been delivered of a **beautiful**, **bouncing**, **baby** website. Watch it grow at: www.ntbcc.org.uk.

JRM writes: My little observation on the much overlooked Broughton St Lane (Issue 187) stated that it *bisects* Picardy Place and Forth St. A tender reader dissected the piece. I now find that bisection is 'a line that divides an angle into two equal parts', and since the lane lies *between* Picardy Place and Forth St and not at right angles *across* them my use of the term was erroneous. Thank you, Dear Reader. Mathematical precision was not and still isn't my forté. I will do better.

**'That blooming flamingo'**, as one exasperated huntress describes it, remains at large (Issue 187). No-one has yet identified its location on Broughton St. The first person to do so will win a **£15 book token**. Keep looking!

During a clean-up of **King George V Park** on 10 Oct., **the latest late presented Christmas tree** was discovered propped against a lamppost by A. McIntosh. There is no truth in the **scurrilous suggestion** that this fir was planted overnight solely in order to fill space in *Spurtle*. Christmas tree, Christmas tree, Christmas tree, Christmas tree.



overlook the obvious

SHIRLEY-ANNE SOMERVILLE MSP – Member of the Scottish Parliament for Lothians (Scottish National Party)



SURGERY TIMES: • Every Monday 10.00–12.00pm at the Scottish Parliament • Call or email for an appointment • Other times by arrangement Email: shirley-anne.somerville. msp@scottishparliament.uk Tel. 0131 348 6823 www.shirleyannesomerville.org

> Malcolm Chisholm MSP Edinburgh North and Leith



Constituency Office: 5 Croall Place, Leith Walk, EH7 4LT Tel: 0131 558 8358 Fax: 0131 557 6781 Saturday surgeries: 9am Leith Library 10.30am Royston/Wardieburn Community Centre 12pm Stockbridge Library Email: Malcolm.Chisholm.msp@ scottish.parliament.uk

**Mark Lazarowicz** MP for Edinburgh North and Leith



Constituency Office: 5 Croall Place, Leith Walk, EH7 4LT Tel: 0131 557 0577 Fax: 0131 557 5759 mark@marklazarowicz.org.uk www.marklazarowicz.org.uk Friday advice sessions: 4.00pm Stockbridge Library, 42 Hamilton Place 5.00pm Ainslie Park Leisure Centre 6.00pm Constituency Office

### New Town/Broughton Community Council

The Community Council represents the views of local residents to Edinburgh City Council

Next meeting:

6 December at 7.30pm

Drummond Community High School (Library).

secretary@ntbcc.org.uk



**Spurtle Team**: John Dickie, Maria Hart, George Hosey, Alan McIntosh, John Ross Maclean, David Sterratt. Post: Spurtle, c/o Narcissus Flowers, 87 Broughton St, Edinburgh EH1 3RJ. Printed at Broughton St Mary's Parish Church.